Googling The Greys

Tips for Searching Beyond Health Databases

and

Turning Information into Insights

Sarah Bonato
Reference Librarian
Centre for Addiction and Mental Health
Ontario Library Association
January 23, 2013
Topics to Be Covered

• Definition of grey literature

• Benefits of adding a grey literature search

• Examples of traditional grey literature sources

• Example of untraditional grey literature sources

• How grey literature can provide added value to reference searches

• Googling for Grey Lit versus using standardized checklists

• Tips & Tricks for using Google for grey literature searching
  – Personalized searching—drawbacks
  – Bypassing location in Google
  – Searching Google, Google UK, Google Australia, Google US government search
  – Filtering

• Alternative search engines to Google

• Sharing, appraising and annotating grey literature search results
Definition of Grey Literature

"Information produced on all levels of government, academia, business and industry in electronic and print formats not controlled by commercial publishing i.e. where publishing is not the primary activity of the producing body."

Definition of Grey Literature, Con’t

"The information and resources that do not categorically fall into what is available via standard traditional or commercial publishing channels."

International Journal on Grey Literature
Why Add Grey Literature to Search Results?

• Searching for unpublished studies or data reduces level of possible bias
  – Exclusion of grey literature from meta analyses can lead to exaggerated estimates of intervention effectiveness
    » Laura McAuley, Ba’ Pham, Peter Tugwell, David Moher. “Does the inclusion of grey literature influence estimates of intervention effectiveness reported in meta-analyses?” *Lancet* 2000; 356:1228–31

• Grey literature documents provide detailed overviews on specific interventions

• Excellent for starting a search on subjects that are not concrete enough for databases searches
Why Add Grey Literature to Search Results? (Con’t)

• Grey literature adds a valuable global perspective to search results

• Grey literature documents provide detailed overviews on specific treatment populations

• Grey literature may be the only source of specific local information

• Grey literature may provide more concrete examples of implementing policies or procedures

• Grey literature may be faster and easier for your patron to quickly read through
Why Add Grey Literature to Search Results? (Con’t)

• Most Grey Literature is available for free
• Can be published and disseminated quickly
• Can locate information intended for specific audiences
  – Nurses
  – Occupational therapists
  – Mental health clinicians
So that PubMed Search Isn’t Enough?

• Journal articles are an excellent information source, but
  – May not provide a broad overview, instead focusing on the outcome of specific interventions
  – Very focused on clinical trails
  – May not provide summary and background history on issues
  – May results in many irrelevant hits
  – May miss key policy sources
  – Lacking in examples of practical execution
  – Grey literature essential for searches on best practices
Traditional Sources of Grey Literature

• Governmental reports
  – publications from the local, national and international sources
• NGO publications
• Dissertations
• Think Tank publications
• Guidelines and position papers from professional organizations
• Publications from national and international health organizations
Key Grey Lit Source-Government Publications!

• Government documents can be from a municipal, state/provincial or national source

• Excellent source of information, since data is often collected at the local and provincial/state level

• *Essential* for health systems research
Examples of Grey Lit from Governmental Sources

• National Examples:

  – Public Health Agency of Canada: *Findings from Enhanced Surveillance of Canadian Street Youth 1999-2003*

  – National Health and Medical Research Council (Australia): *Clinical Practice Guidelines- Familial Aspects of Cancer: A guide to clinical practice*

  – Substance Abuse and Mental Health Service Administration (US) : *Preventing Suicide A Toolkit for High Schools*
Examples of Grey Lit from Governmental Sources Con’t

• Provincial/State Examples

  – Ontario Ministry of Health and Long Term Care: *A Program Framework for Mental Health Diversion/Court Support Services*

  – Vermont Department of Health: *Recommendations for Management of Diabetes for Children in School*
Examples of Grey Lit from Governmental Sources Con’t

• Municipal Examples:
  – Toronto Public Health: *Health Status News—Toronto Breastfeeding Rates*
  
  – New York City Department of Health and Hygiene: *Healthy Homes: Keeping Housing Healthy and Safe for Children*
Types of Untraditional Grey Literature Publications

- Blogs
- Toolkits
- Health Consumer Organizations
- PowerPoint Presentations
- Pamphlets/Factsheets
- Untraditional sources may provide excellent information
Come out, come out wherever you are!

• Many national and international organizations publish grey literature, but can be difficult to identify

• Main sources for grey literature
  – The New York Academy of Medicine Library’s *Grey Literature Report*

• Web site checklists for grey literature
  – CADTH’s *Grey Matters: a practical search tool for evidence-based medicine*

• Web sites or databases tracking specific grey literature sources can be retired at any time
Googling for Grey Literature

- Excellent for publications not indexed by databases
- Speeds up searching
- Great for identifying publications from organizations that may be unfamiliar
- No need to rely on checklists that may not be outdated or only focus on larger organizations
Google Personalized Searching, For Everyone

WHETHER IT IS HELPFUL OR NOT!

• Launched in 2009

• Customized results according to past search history linked to your browser using cookies and location by IP address

• Google has been assigned a patent for personalized network searching

• Personalized search history can be turned off, but location still will influence hits
Google Personalized Searching Con’t

• Search results are influenced by search histories

• Browser version—Google assumes that anything less than the latest version means a less sophisticated searcher

  • *The Filter Bubble: What the Internet is Hiding from You*, by Eli Pariser

• Personalized hits criticized for poorer quality information, lacking in diverse results

• Geographic location influences search results immensely
Location, Location, Location and Google Searching

But in order to find diverse information, you have to look beyond the Google you always see and use…
Incorporating Location into a Google Grey Literature Search

• Broadening a Google Search to include hits from diverse locations can be accomplished by:
  – Using country specific Google search engines and limiting results to that country
  – Limiting by a country domain in Google Advance Search
  – Using Google Advance Search and limiting to region
Using Country Specific Google Search Engines

• Easiest way to find diverse grey lit search results

• Can focus on any country

• Look beyond our borders—Ireland and New Zealand are excellent sources of grey lit
Example guideline search subject—Recommended Sodium Intake

- Recommended sodium intake guidelines vary

- Using country specific Google searches can be designed to retrieve geographically unique content

- The US, Canada, United Kingdom, Australia, and New Zealand do not have the same recommended sodium intake values:
  - Canada 1,000 -1,500 mg of sodium per day
  - Australia 1,600 mg of sodium per day
  - New Zealand 1,600 to 2300 mg of sodium per day
  - United Kingdom 1,600 sodium mg per day
  - US guidelines-- intake is recommended at no more than 2,300 mg of sodium per day. Those with hypertension, African-Americans, and middle-aged and older adults should limit intake to 1,500 mg of sodium per day
Demo Searches

• Google

• Google UK

• Google Australia
Example Searches

- A grey literature search on sodium intake guidelines can include hits from Google Canada, Google UK, Google Ireland, Google Australia, Google New Zealand

- Purposefully retrieving content from specific geographical regions adds diversity and wide range to results
  - Also you are locating content that patron may not have been able to locate

- Varying your search terms is a good way to find hits for different reading levels and populations.
  - Providing different format content is added value to search results
Search in Just Plain Google

- Search terms: sodium intake guidelines
Google UK

• Use Google to find Google UK

• Conduct a Search

• Under search tools, limit the search to pages from the UK
Benefits of Searching Google UK

• National Health Service produces large quantity and superior quality of grey lit

• NHS regions produce unique content

• Other UK organizations also have quality grey literature content
Google UK Search
www.google.co.uk
Google UK Search
Without limiting to UK pages

About 3,680,000 results (0.24 seconds)

Scholarly articles for sodium intake guidelines
Sodium intake and risk of death from stroke in ... Hagata - Cited by 142
Sodium intake and mortality in the NHANES III followup ... Cohen - Cited by 100
Dietary sodium Intake and subsequent risk of ... Hs - Cited by 341

CDC - Salt Home - DHHS
www.cdc.gov/salt

14 Dec 2012 - In addition to excess sodium intake, other factors also influence blood ... Current dietary guidelines for Americans recommend that adults in ...

Salt the facts - Live Well - NHS Choices
www.nhs.uk/Livewell/Goodfood/Pages/salt.aspx

Find out about your recommended daily salt intake, and how to cut down on salt, ... Children should eat less (see below for recommendations for babies and ...

Salt: How to tame your salt habit now - MayoClinic.com
www.mayoclinic.com > ... > Nutrition and healthy eating > In-Depth

The 2010 Dietary Guidelines for Americans recommend limiting sodium to less than ... of sodium, eating these foods does add to your overall sodium intake.

Sodium in the Diet
www.ext.colostate.edu/pubs/foodnut/09364.html

The maximum recommended level of sodium intake is 2,300 mg per day. Sodium is ... One of the Dietary Guidelines for Americans is to avoid too much sodium.
Limiting to Pages from the UK

- Search terms: sodium intake guidelines limited to UK results
UK Google Search Results

Scholarly articles for sodium intake guidelines
Sodium intake and risk of death from stroke in .... Nagata - Cited by 142
Sodium intake and mortality in the Prospective Follow-up .... Cohen - Cited by 100
Dietary sodium intake and subsequent risk of .... Ha - Cited by 341

Salt: the facts - Live Well - NHS Choices
www.nhs.uk/Livewell/Goodfood/Pages/salt.aspx
Find out about your recommended daily salt intake, and how to cut down on salt, ...
Children should eat less (see below for recommendations for babies and ...

Recommendations on salt
www.actiononsalt.org.uk/healthy-eating/Recommendations%20on%20salt/
The report considered that "current sodium intakes are needlessly high and we ...
Officer (CMO) to endorse the COMA recommendations to reduce salt intake ...

Why 6g? A summary of the scientific evidence for the salt intake target ...
www.food.gov.uk/multimedia/docs/publication/why6g0408.pdf
File Format: PDF/Adobe Acrobat - Quick View
salt intake from current levels to the 6g per .... salt and health that underpins the 6g a day salt intake target .... and no clinical guidelines exist for the diagnosis ...

Report on dietary sodium intakes | Department of Health
www.dh.gov.uk > Home > Policy areas > Public health > Nutrition
21 Jun 2012 – The great majority of sodium intake is in the form of salt .... Dietary
Searching Google Australia

• Google Australia an excellent source of grey literature results
• Shared similarities results in relevancy
  – Universal Health Care
  – Immigration
  – Aboriginal Populations
Search in Google Australia
www.google.com.au
Google Australia Search
Without Limiting to Australian Pages

About 4,150,000 results (0.31 seconds)

Salt and Hypertension | Nutrition Australia
www.nutritionaustralia.org > Frequently Asked Questions
What are the current recommendations for salt intake, and how much salt are Australians actually eating? The National Health and Medical Research Council ...

Salt | Better Health Channel
www.betterhealth.vic.gov.au > Food and nutrition - Foods
The scientific literature linking sodium intake to blood pressure is extensive and ... Populations with a high average salt intake have a higher average blood ...

Sodium: How to tame your salt habit now - MayoClinic.com
www.mayoclinic.com > Nutrition and healthy eating - Intakes
The 2010 Dietary Guidelines for Americans recommend limiting sodium to less than ... of sodium, eating these foods does add to your overall sodium intake.

Salt - Wikipedia, the free encyclopedia
on.wikipedia.org/wiki/Salt
Jump to Recommended intake: Recommended intakes of salt are usually expressed in terms of ... readers to the dietary guidelines given by this authority.

CDC - Salt Home - NHSDP
www.cdc.gov/salt
14 Dec 2012 – In addition to excess sodium intake, other factors also influence blood
Search in Google Australia
Search terms: sodium intake guidelines limited to Australian results
Searching in Google Advance Search With Region Limit

• Alternative to using country specific Google Search engines
• Search results are very similar, but ranking of sites are different
• Google Advance Search allows for more search filters to be applied on one page
Sample Google Advanced Search

• Example search subject
  – Trauma Informed Care
    • Searching for term as a phrase
  
  – Search limited to pages from Canada
Google Advanced Search

- any of these words:

- none of these words:

- members ranging from: to

Then narrow your results by:

- language:
  - any language

- region:

- last update:
  - anytime

- site or domain:

- terms appearing:
  - anywhere in the page

- SafeSearch:
  - off
  - moderate
  - strict

- reading level:
  - no reading level displayed

- file type:
  - any format

- usage rights:
  - not filtered by licence

Advanced Search
Search Results

Trauma-Informed Care - CrisisPrevention.com
www.crisispreadvention.com/TIC
Strategies and Approaches To Promote a Culture of Care
Free Training Resources Knowledge Base
Nonviolent Crisis Intervention Training and Events

From National Center for Trauma-Informed Care
www.nationalcenterfortrauma-informedcare.org
File Format: PDF/Adobe Acrobat - Quick View
National Center for Trauma-Informed Care 4500 Montgomery Avenue, Suite 800
North Bethesda, MD 20814 p. 301-834-2785 f. 301-834-1801

From The Trauma Toolkit - Trauma-Informed
www.thetraumakit.com/docs/Trauma-Informed_Toolkit.pdf
File Format: PDF/Adobe Acrobat - Quick View

The benefits of providing trauma informed care, regardless of the setting, are many.
While the benefits to the client/patient are primary and may be obvious

Resources: Trauma-Informed care
knowledgebank.net/trauma_informed_care.aspx
A selection of articles on trauma informed care from CAMH's CrossCurrents magazine, The PowerPoint presentation Trauma Informed Care: Implementation in

From Essentials of Trauma-Informed Care - British Columbia Centre
File Format: PDF/Adobe Acrobat - Quick View
Trauma-Informed Care: What is trauma? Trauma is defined as experience that
overwhelms an individual's capacity to cope. Whether it is experienced early in...
Searching in Google Advance Search Using Domain Limits

- Domain limits are a quality filter to retrieve more relevant search results.
- Using domain limits may be the only way to retrieve content that would be lost in a Google search.
- Best bests domain limits:
  - org
  - edu
  - int
  - gov
Key Grey Lit Searching Tip—Limiting to gov

- Much quality content is available from US sources
- National, state and local US governments produce quality grey lit
- Locating can be difficult, due to vast amounts of available information
- Just limiting to US region does not retrieve quality hits, more filters are needed
- **Must exclude PubMed hits**
  - Google search command is `-pubmed`
Search in Google limited to domain gov

- Search terms: sodium intake guidelines
- Limited to the domain gov and -pubmed
Search Results
Using Domain org

- Domain org an excellent filter to use for grey literature searches

- Can be used in Google Advanced Search or by command

- Best combined with other limits to increase retrieval of primarily grey literature hits
Sample Search

• Sample search topic:
  – student support and mental illness

• Search limits-
  – org
  – Exclude PubMed hits
  – Limit to file type PDF
Google Search

Advanced Search

Find pages with...

all these words: student support

this exact word or phrase: mental illness

any of these words:

none of these words: pubmed

numbers ranging from: to

Then narrow your results by...

language: any language
Google Search Results

PDF toolkit - Prevent Mental Illness with Early Detection
www.preventmentalillness.org/images/pdfs/Teacherstockkit.pdf
File Format: PDF/Adobe Acrobat - Quick View

symptoms of mental illness and how to get help. You should place these posters in an area where students are most likely to see them. Bookmarks: Every toolkit ...

Focus on Mental Health - Colleges Ontario
File Format: PDF/Adobe Acrobat - Quick View
represented on student unions. Some recurring themes raised by all the speakers were "listen to the kids" and "recognition of mental illness and help needs to ...

TIged Mental Health Thematic Classroom - Teen Mental Health
File Format: PDF/Adobe Acrobat - Quick View
preloaded with activities and resources designed to help you and your students explore ... students suffering from a mental illness in a class of 30 students ...

School-Based Mental Health Services Promote Academic Success
File Format: PDF/Adobe Acrobat - Quick View
Well-coordinated student support services can be effectively structured ... emotional and behavioral problems, including chronic mental illness. Services are ...

Getting Help - F.O.R.C.E. Society for Kids' Mental Health
www.forceociety.org/.../Getting_Help_blogs%20May%202012.pdf
File Format: PDF/Adobe Acrobat - Quick View
the symptoms of mental illness, ... support agencies such as the F.O.R.C.E. Society for Kids' Mental ... Check with your local Student Support Services office ...

What is Supported Education? - the Adult Mental Health Division
www.hla.aff.gov/.../...
“Be obscure clearly”
E.B. White

• When Googling for grey literature remember:
  
  • Different terms and vocabulary are used to capture like ideas
  
  • Not varying your search terms will result in fewer and less diverse hits
    
    – Examples: university students, college students, youth, adolescent, aboriginals, Native Americans, First Nations.
And Sometimes Google isn’t always the greatest

• Google Scholar does not include most quality grey lit sources

• Grey lit searching for systematic reviews should include specific sites, not just a google search
  – IE www.clinicaltrials.gov/

• Using or creating customized Google Search Engines
  – Good for grey lit searches, only when you know all of the sources that should be searched
Ways to Filter Search Results

- Search for specific domain endings—i.e. org, edu
- Exclude domain endings—i.e. -pubmed in a US search
- Vary between British and American spelling or phrases—i.e. use search terms ministry of health or youth or aboriginal
- Select or add specific file types
- Select year range
- Reading level
- Exclude hits from specific journals
- Regions—limit results to a specific region
- **Allintext** to search for documents with specific words in the text
- ~ to find similar terms. Beware—this is focused very much on terms and phrases commonly used in the US
- Use **link:** to find sites that link to a desired URL or related: to find web pages that are similar to the URL. A great way to find organizations that you are not familiar with.
Alternatives to Google

(YES Virginia, there ARE alternatives!)

• **DuckDuckGo**
  - [https://duckduckgo.com](https://duckduckgo.com)
    Search results are not personalized, so different users will receive the same results when an identical strategy is used

• **Startpage**
  - [https://startpage.com](https://startpage.com)
    Offers the web search results directly from Google, but its privacy settings means that location and pervious search histories are not recorded
Google Search on
Safer Injection Facilities

Scholarly articles for safe injection facilities
Safe Injection facilities in Canada: Is it time? - Kerr - Cited by 35
Safe Injection facilities in North America: Their place in ... Broadhead - Cited by 107
Establishing safe injection facilities in Canada: Legal ... Elliott - Cited by 17

Supervised injection site - Wikipedia, the free encyclopedia
Jump to Operating facilities: An injection room was not originally conceived, however, drug users began to use the facility for this purpose, and this soon ...

Ontario rejects safe injection sites | News | National Post
news.nationalpost.com/ontario-rejects-safe-injection-sites/

Drug injection sites urged for Ottawa, Toronto - Ottawa - CBC News
www.cbc.ca/.../ottawa-safe-injection-site-study-released.html

Insite - Supervised Injection Site
superinjection.ca
DuckDuckGo Search on Safer Injection Facilities

Injection - Cheap Prices
Cheap Prices and Huge Selection. Injection on Sale!
calibex.com

Supervised Consumption Facilities & Safe Injection Facilities (SCFs and SIFs)
(SIF Target Populations) Researchers for the European Monitoring Centre on Drugs and Drug Addiction (EMCDDA) looking into safer injection facilities and drug consumption rooms found that...
drugwarfacts.org/cms/Safe_Injection

Supervised injection site - Wikipedia, the free encyclopedia
Supervised injection sites (SIS) (also known as supervised injection facilities, safe injection site, safer injection facility (SIF), drug consumption facility (DCF) or medically supervised injection center (MSCC)...
en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Supervised_injection_site

Insite - Supervised Injection Site
Insite has been a safe, health-focused place where people inject drugs and connect to health care & social services. Insite is North America’s first legal supervised injection site.
supervisedinjectionvle.ca

Harm Reduction Coalition: Safer Injection Facilities
Safer Injection Facilities. Safe Injection Facilities (SIFs) are legally protected places where drug users consume pre-obtained drugs in a non-judgmental environment and receive health care...
harmreductionradicaldesigns.org/section.php?id=94

Safe Injection Facilities
Evidence also indicates that safe injection facilities contribute to the activities associated with the three pillars of treatment, enforcement, and prevention.
Startpage Search on Safer Injection Facilities
Sample of Recent Grey Literature Searches

• Respectful language use with psychiatric/addiction clients

• Community partnerships

• Best practices for youth with concurrent disorders

• Nutrition & Seniors

• Ultra Rapid Detox for heroin abuse
More Samples of Grey Literature Results

- Checklist for evaluating housing for fire safety and child safety
  - *Content too specific to locate in journal literature*
- Housing policy and homelessness
  - *Journal literature focused on specific interventions*
- Mentoring and clinical placements
  - *Journal literature did not provide broad overview*
- Smoke free hospital campuses—practical implementation steps
  - *Journal literature hits were older*
Critical Appraisal of Grey Literature Results

- Traditional steps of critical appraisal can be applied to grey literature sources
  - Easily can identify producing source
  - Conflicts of interest
    • References, funding, reputation of organizations
  - Data justifying conclusions
  - Relevancy of publication
Sharing Grey Literature Search Results

• Email with links

• Provide overview with links
  – Content
  – Title
  – Authorship
  – Location of relevant information
  – Other notations
Good Afternoon,

I have enclosed a list of links to sites that have quite a bit of info on community partnerships—there are some excellent documents available from various organizations. The list of links is arranged by title with notation of author(s) of the document. I have also enclosed some general links on organizing community partnerships that are not health related.

Please note that this is not an extensive search of all available internet resources, but just a selection of key ones that came up in the search. The list includes documents from both Canadian and international sources.

Cheers,

Sarah Bonato
Reference Librarian
Centre for Addiction and Mental Health
23 Russell Street
Toronto, ON
M5R 2S1 Canada
Tel. 416-555-8501 ext. 6653
Sample Email Cont’d

Health-related links

Building an Academic-Community Partnered Network—PowerPoint presentation from the conference Partnering to Improve Health: The Science of Community Engagement May 13-14 2010
http://www.idlab.org/journal/16-1s1/attm-16-1s1-3.pdf

Building and Sustaining a Methamphetamine Community Coalition—document by the California Governor’s Prevention Advisory Council Methamphetamine Implementation Workgroup

Building and Sustaining Community Partnerships for Teen Pregnancy Prevention—a working paper by Sharon Loucks Edwards and Renee Freedman Stern with Cornerstone Consulting Group, Inc
http://aspe.hhs.gov/asp/teens/teenpreg/teenpreg.htm#Difficulties

Effective clinical partnerships between primary care medical practices and public health agencies—a paper by the American Medical Association
Conclusion

• Grey literature provides valuable content to patron requests

• Goggling for grey literature is a quick way to add diversity and unique content to search results

• Savvy searching will allow you to bypass Google’s personalized search results

• In order to find and include diverse search hits, you must take steps to bypass search results based on search location
WRAP UP
AND
QUESTIONS?
References

- Lehman Richard and Loder Elizabeth. “Missing Clinical Trial Data: A threat to the integrity of evidenced based medicine”. BMJ (2012; Jan 3) d8158
- Mullally, U. “Why the web is telling us what it thinks we want to hear” Irish Times (2011, Jun 29) pp. 15.
- Sodium intake guidelines retrieved on 5/31/2012 from:
  - Health Canada (http://www.hc-sc.gc.ca/fn-an/nutrition/sodium/index-eng.php )
  - Nutrition Australia (http://www.nutritionaustralia.org)
  - National Health Services (http://www.nhs.uk/Livewell/Goodfood/Pages/salt.aspx )
  - USDA Center for Nutrition Policy and Promotion (http://www.cnpp.usda.gov/dietaryguidelines.htm)